

of the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, Chocano Mena provides scholars with useful information about the formation of Mexico's early and middle colonial period culture.

MAGALI M. CARRERA
*University of Massachusetts,
 Dartmouth*

JIM NORRIS. *After "The Year Eighty": The Demise of Franciscan Power in Spanish New Mexico*. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, with the Academy of American Franciscan History. 2000. Pp. x, 212. \$39.95.

Scholars have long seen the Pueblo Revolt as a pivotal event in the history of the Spanish Southwest, a watershed that in so many ways marked the beginning of a new era. In August 1680, the united Pueblo peoples overthrew Spanish rule, drove the Spaniards out of the upper Rio Grande valley, and remained independent for over a decade. Under the leadership of Don Diego de Vargas, Spain managed to subjugate anew the Pueblos and reincorporate New Mexico into its empire during the 1690s, but things were never the same in this colonial outpost on the northern frontier. One important post-revolt change proved to be the ascendancy of civil over ecclesiastical authority in the province. Historian Jim Norris addresses this particular theme and demonstrates the ways in which the Franciscan presence—so prominent before 1680—diminished considerably in Spain's far northern colony of New Mexico after "the year eighty." The author contends that the Franciscan decline was not immediate but rather was "an evolutionary process that began with the Pueblo revolt in 1680 and continued throughout most of the eighteenth century" (p. 5).

Following a brief introduction, Norris begins his study with an overview of Franciscan institutional organization and the extent of their missionary activity, economic importance, and political clout in New Mexico during the pre-revolt era. He then provides a richly researched profile of the "typical" Franciscan who ministered in eighteenth-century New Mexico: a *criollo* (American born) of urban background who lacked sufficient training, experience, or vigor to work effectively on the northern frontier. These group characteristics, the author feels, contributed greatly to the Franciscans' ultimate failure in the province.

The remaining chapters focus on the formal institutions of Spanish civil and ecclesiastical government and the personalities who operated within those structures and trace chronologically the decline of Franciscan power in New Mexico. The challenge came primarily from civil officials—in Spain, New Spain, and the province—who viewed New Mexico in a different light after 1680. French imperial threats, increased hostilities from mobile, non-subject Indians (especially the Comanches and Apaches), and the Bourbon monarchy's proclivity toward military rule cast New Mexico as a defensive outpost of empire rather than a field for

evangelization. Thus, civil rather than ecclesiastical authority now guided provincial affairs. The undermining of the Franciscans, argues Norris, was more episodic than steady. The order suffered its greatest setbacks in the first decades of the 1700s (during the governorships of José Chacón and Juan Ignacio Flores Mogollón) and at mid-century (especially during the administrations of Joaquín Codallos y Rabal and Tomás Vélez Cachupín). Over the long haul, the results were unmistakable: from being the preeminent economic, political, and cultural force in the seventeenth century, the Franciscans had become by the 1770s marginal players on the provincial stage.

Civil officials may have led the charge to marginalize the order, but religious personnel, including the Franciscans themselves, also contributed to their undoing. The diocese of Durango successfully laid claim to New Mexico, although it never effectively controlled provincial resources or replaced the Franciscans with secular priests. Furthermore, Franciscan leadership in Mexico City proved unresponsive to the need for adequate preparation, especially in languages, for mission personnel. And save a few exceptions, Franciscans in New Mexico paid scant interest to learning Native tongues or caring spiritually for their charges. The Order of St. Francis, argues Norris, fell short in its duty to evangelize.

Norris is to be commended for his solid archival research, and while the idea of eighteenth-century Franciscan decline is nothing new, he does well in showing certain ways through which the process occurred. The author could have further enriched this work had he expanded his inquiry beyond the bounds of formal institutional structures and had sought to examine the issues more broadly. For example, how and in what ways did the ordinary inhabitants of colonial New Mexico—Native American and Hispanic—contribute to the demise of Franciscan authority? Norris makes clear the missionaries' deficiencies with respect to Native languages, and he posits that Pueblo groups perhaps deliberately led missionaries astray when trying to master them, but he fails to discuss fully this important dimension of Native participation in the Franciscans' collapse. One wonders, too, about changes in the relationship between the Hispanic population and the Franciscan missionaries. On its own terms, however, the book stands as a solid scholarly contribution, best suited to specialists in the fields of the Spanish borderlands and colonial Latin America.

CHARLES CUTTER
Purdue University

DAVID CAREY, JR. and ALLAN F. BURNS. *Our Elders Teach Us: Maya-Kaqchikel Historical Perspectives*. (Contemporary American Indian Studies.) Tuscaloosa: University of Alabama Press. 2001. Pp. xv, 385. \$24.95.

At the very beginning of this book, Allan F. Burns sets the agenda succinctly for David Carey, Jr., by posing a question that cuts to the quick of the subject about to be discussed: "What would the history of Guatemala, or for that matter the history of the Americas, look like if the basic concepts were taken from Mayan oral tradition rather than European-dominated historiography?" (p. ix). Carey pieces together his key answer—decidedly different and often at odds, both internally and in relation to the dominant canon—in ways that make for a provocative and unhinging read, one that challenges us to rethink and reformulate the fundamentals of scholarly inquiry and exposition.

In his opening chapter, "Methodology," Carey makes it clear that his detailed narrative of a handful of Mayan communities in the Central Highlands of Guatemala emphasizes his "five years of living in and returning to these towns," an experience that furnished him "with an understanding of the context and reality of Kaqchikel and allowed me the opportunity to learn about historical perspectives and relevant events in Kaqchikel history" (p. 2). Patiently investing time in building up local confidence and in gaining a full-fledged command of Kaqchikel, one of some twenty Mayan languages spoken in Guatemala, Carey lived among the people he would study "prior to researching documentation," a strategy that enabled him "to frame questions from oral histories, not from histories in the archives" (p. 1). What he unearths and discloses from the experience goes against the grain of all sorts of established thinking on Guatemala and enriches our knowledge substantially.

Notwithstanding his decision to exclude "privileged information that was too private, too personal, or too politically dangerous" (p. 20), Carey weaves a historically framed ethnography that is rich, layered, and nuanced, affording the reader "a broad view of Kaqchikel historical perspectives" (p. 3) generated by fieldwork for the most part conducted in San Juan Comalapa, San José Poaquil, Tecpán, San Antonio Aguas Calientes, and Santa Catarina Barahona. His goal is not to "present oral histories alone but rather contextualize them with reference to written sources" (p. 24), some of which contradict evidence gathered during the interview process, or vice versa. The range of topics covered is impressive, from "Town Origins" (chapter one) to "Ethnic Relations" (chapter nine), "Epidemics" (chapter three) to "Natural Disasters" (chapter four), with Carey and his participants also deliberating at length on "Land, Labor, and Integration" (chapter two) and "Education, Exclusion, and Assertiveness" (chapter five). Particularly illuminating are discussions that focus on native involvement in the military (chapter six), Maya recollections of the authoritarian regime of Jorge Ubico, in power from 1931 to 1944 (chapter seven), and the thorny issue of community leadership (chapter eight).

Carey is sympathetic to his Kaqchikel protagonists at all times, allowing them to express opinions at an individual level that run contrary to more generalized

comprehension of certain historical situations. Of the liberal reforms of Justo Rufino Barrios, for example, which caused widespread loss of land in Maya communities between 1873 and 1885, Carey presents the views of one informant from Comalapa who asserts that "Barrios did a good job because a long time ago the land had no owners . . . Barrios gave security to families and their land. He had a good idea and did it well" (p. 86). Another informant, also from Comalapa, is critical of the land reform policies of Jacobo Arbenz Guzmán (1951–1954), stating: "The agrarian law he passed was bad. He did not help the Maya with it" (p. 99). While recording these viewpoints, indeed any Maya perspective, serves a useful informative purpose, there are occasions when Carey needs to guide the reader with greater care and more authority as to how events unfolded beyond the confines of the communities under scrutiny. It is often the case in Guatemala, as Carey well understands, that what happened in one place at one time may have transpired very differently in a community just a few kilometers away.

Letting people have their say is one matter; accounting responsibly for what they uphold is another. "Fuentes y Guzman," a seventeenth-century chronicler, "did not get it right, at least for our people" (p. 78), one source tells Carey. "He did not find out about our reality, land, work, or life." Fair enough. Carey needs to elaborate, however, on why such a view and myriad others might be valid, including correcting himself about who Fuentes y Guzman actually was. He was not, as Carey states, a "Spanish historian" (p. 46) but a member of the *criollo* elite with as much antipathy for imperial Spain as lack of appreciation for Maya culture. Nor was Antigua, the colonial capital known as Santiago de Guatemala, ever "buried" (p. 45) by an earthquake. Buildings were certainly toppled and the site of the capital moved to present-day Guatemala City. But life in Antigua carried on, with Mayans taking an active part in keeping things going, as they still do all over Guatemala today.

W. GEORGE LOVELL
Queen's University at Kingston,
Canada

LARA PUTNAM. *The Company They Kept: Migrants and the Politics of Gender in Caribbean Costa Rica, 1870–1960*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press. 2002. pp. xii, 303. Cloth \$49.95, paper \$19.95.

In this book, Lara Putnam delivers a vivid account of labor practices, gender relations, and social change against the backdrop of the United Fruit Company's (UFCO) expansion of banana operations in Central America. Seeking to correct older interpretations that depict regional events as dependent on UFCO managers or the government officials who encouraged the company's activities within their states' borders, Putnam places the men and women who traveled to the coastal city of Port Limón from the West Indies and the Central American highlands at the center of her